

Mach 25, 2020

A regular meeting of the Troy Planning Commission was held Wednesday, March 25, 2020, at 3:30 p.m. in Council Chambers, second floor, City Hall. Members present: Titterington, Wolke, Oda and Ehrlich; Staff attending: Zoning Inspector Watson and Development Director Davis. Also Attending – Grant Kerber, Director of Law.

As the President and Vice Chairman could not attend, Mr. Wolke was elected temporary Chairman for this meeting.

The Minutes of the March 11 meeting were approved upon motion of Mr. Titterington, seconded by Mrs. Ehrlich.

HISTORIC DISTRICT APPLICATION FOR 101 E. WATER STREET, FOR MODIFICATIONS OF PAINTING GARAGE, REPLACING THE GARAGE DOORS, REPLACING PATIO AND WALKWAY IN THE REAR YARD; OWNER/APPLICANT – DAVID AND SUZANNE BURLEY. Staff reported: property is zoned R-7; property is not on the National Register of Historic Places; application elements are:

- Repaint the existing detached garage from the current yellow color to Valspar Cool Gray (7006-10) and paint the trim with Valspar Very Black (5011-12) to match the existing home.
- Remove existing patio and walkway, replacing them with poured concrete. The patio area is a mix of flagstone, gravel and pavers. The walkway to the garage is made with brick that's sunken in and extremely uneven.
- Replace the existing and what appears to be the original wood carriage style doors. With two 8 ft x 8 ft, traditional, white, stamped steel garage door. (Example Attached) The applicant proposes installing black hardware giving the appearance of being a hinged door.

Staff recommended approval of the proposed painting, patio and walkway modifications. In regards to the garage doors, staff doesn't recommend approval. The garage doors appear original to the garage and believe the applicant could preserve the existing wood doors or provide a more appropriate replacement. The garage doors have a unique look and are a character defining feature. If the doors cannot be repaired or made useable the applicants should seek a more suitable replacement with a door similar to the existing:

- The proposed modifications to the garage and patio will meet City of Troy requirements; and
- The proposed modifications will not detract from the historic integrity of the building.
- The garage doors being a character defining feature to the structure and original per the Secretary of the Interior Standards states: that Deteriorated architectural features shall be repaired rather than replaced whenever possible, substantiated by historic, physical or pictorial evidence.
- If removed the current proposed doors and the proposed hardware would not meet the standards for replacement by the Secretary of the Interior: "Materials utilized in exterior renovations, additions and construction of accessory or new principal structures shall either match the appearance of the materials used in construction of the original buildings or shall be modern construction materials which create the same effect and shall not be a cosmetic treatment which simulates original fabric."

Commission Members stated concurrence with staff that they would like to see the garage door architectural features saved or replicated. Staff commented that that was discussed with the applicant, but the applicant preferred to not change the application prior to submittal to the Planning Commission. The applicant was present and indicated the new garage door is requested as the current door has rotted, and he would prefer one that is more durable and without glass for security purposes. Mr. Titterington stated his concern is that this garage is more visible than nearby with the same door. Staff indicated that as the applicant has now indicated he will use a door with hardware that makes the door look more like a carriage door, staff would now make a positive recommendation. A motion was made by Mrs. Ehrlich, seconded by Mayor Oda, that the historic district application for 101 E. Water Street be approved as submitted, based on colors and materials submitted along with the revised garage information, and is now recommended by staff's findings that:

- The proposed modifications to the garage and patio will meet City of Troy requirements; and
- The proposed modifications will not detract from the historic integrity of the building.
- The garage doors be approved as viewed by the Commission.

MOTION PASSED, UNANIMOUS VOTE

CHIMNEY REMOVAL, 2 E. MAIN STREET. Staff advised that two chimneys on the building at 2 E. Main Street were damaged during the January tornado and should be removed; these chimneys cannot be seen from the street and have no historic value. A motion was made Mayor Oda, seconded by Mrs. Ehrlich, that the Commission approves the removal of the two damaged chimneys from 2 E. Main Street, as shown to the Commission during the meeting.

MOTION PASSED, UNANIMOUS VOTE

EXECUTIVE SESSION. A motion was made by Mr. Titterington, seconded by Mrs. Ehrlich, that the Commission recess into Executive Session to confer with legal counsel to consider pending litigation. At 3:50 p.m. the Commission recessed into Executive Session.

At 4:10 p.m. a motion was made by Mayor Oda, seconded by Mrs. Ehrlich, to return to regular session.

MOTION PASSED, UNANIMOUS VOTE

A motion was made by Mr. Titterington, seconded by Mayor Oda, that the Development Director be authorized to sign on behalf of the Planning Commission answers to interrogatories and request for information related to pending litigation between RL Hawk LLC vs the City of Troy and the City of Troy, Planning Commission.

MOTION PASSED, UNANIMOUS VOTE

There being no further business, the meeting adjourned at 4:12 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Chairman

Secretary