

A regular meeting of the Troy Planning Commission was held remotely on Wednesday, November 11, 2020, at 3:30 p.m., with Chairman Alan Kappers presiding. Members attending – Titterington, Wolke, Oda, McGarry, Westmeyer, and Ehrlich; Staff attending: Development Director Davis, Assistant Development Director Harris, Zoning Inspector Robert Watson, and City Engineer J. Rhoades.

MINUTES OF OCTOBER 28 MEETING. Minutes were approved upon motion of Mr. McGarry, second by Mr. Westmeyer.

HISTORIC DISTRICT APPLICATION – DEMOLITION OF 112-118 W. MAIN STREET, OWNER/APPLICANT 116 W MAIN LLC – RANDY KIMMEL. At the request of the applicant, this item remained on the table.

ALLEY VACATION PETITION BY FIRST UNITED METHODIST CHURCH. The staff report noted that the First United Methodist Church has petitioned for the vacation of alley, 12'x66', along the east side of Inlots 376 and 375 and the west side of Inlots 369 and 370, located south of West Franklin Street and running off of West Canal Street; the alley does not extend the entire length of the block between West Franklin and West Canal Streets; the City is not aware of any buried infrastructure but will retain an easement; the petitioner is the only abutting property owner; vacating the alley will not adversely impact any of the neighbors and is not utilized as an alley, and staff recommends approval. It was noted there is another alley south of that petitioned for vacation, but the vacation of that alley is not included in this petition.

It was noted that there is an access easement created in 1989 with a prior alley vacation, which will need to be vacated as a part of a future replat in order for the owner to replat their properties into a single lot. The City Engineer advised that the County requested that the alley vacation and the vacation of the access easement be handled as separate plats. It was noted that an alley will remain within the block and will not be vacated as it is used by other property owners.

A motion was made by Mr. McGarry, seconded by Mrs. Ehrlich, to recommend to Troy City Council that the 12x66' alley along the east side of Inlots 376 and 375 and the west side of Inlots 369 and 370 be approved as the petitioner is the only abutting property owner, and that easements within the alley are be retained.

MOTION PASSED, UNANIMOUS VOTE

HISTORIC DISTRICT APPLICATION, NEW PROPOSED BUILDING AT 110 E. CANAL STREET; OWNER/APPLICANT CITY OF TROY, LOCATION OF NEW FIRE STATION 1.

The staff report noted: "parcel is located mid-block between E. Canal Street and E. Race Street, a through lot which connects to S. Walnut Street, and is a vacant parcel; property is zoned B-3, Central Business District; applicant is requesting the redevelopment of the property for the use of a new Fire Station Number One; the building will be a total of 17,368 square feet, a two-story structure, with the main portion of the building being front loaded towards the corner of E. Canal and S. Walnut Streets; the apparatus bays will be setback further for an appropriate driveway and safer movement onto E. Canal Street; design and layout of the proposed site was created by KZF Design architectural firm, taking into consideration of the surrounding property types, architecture, property uses and feedback from staff; the proposed design gives the site a new contemporary styled building, that relates to the surrounding architecture in the historic district instead of recreating a design or a disruption to the block; design places the building front loaded and massed similar to the other three corners of the intersection at E. Canal and S. Walnut Streets, while also providing nice architectural features that reflect the previous building design, that had stone lintels, a larger mass, flat roof and was front loaded to the street. Along with taking into consideration other similar sized buildings in the area and architecture within the historic district; the site design accounts for the multiple frontages by providing design elements on all sides of the structure, this design also steps the building elevations down as it approaches the residential neighborhood to the east providing a transition to smaller structures; the parking and majority of the landscaping being to the east provide a transition and buffer; the design addresses the needs of the Fire Department, for staffing, building size, building function, vehicle turning radiuses and off-street parking; exterior of the structure will be constructed of a brick masonry veneer in the color of Indian Full Range, with a split-faced concrete block base in the color of Boston Gray; cast stone accent bands around the first and second floor levels, cast stone capped roof line, window headers and lintels, along with cast stone accents of arched, headers above the main entry, several first-floor windows, and the front doors of the apparatus bays; the E. Canal Street elevation will also feature a parapet using cast stone, and bracketed cornice detail; all cast stone for the site will be smooth-faced in appearance and in the color of Natural, the rear of the building will also incorporate arched masonry detail for the rear entry way; the balcony on the second floor above the rear entry will have a black aluminum railing to match the lighting and trim details; main and rear entry doors will be aluminum framed, with insulated glass, and black in color; service doors, and secondary entrance doors will be aluminum framed, and dark gray in color; majority of the windows will be 1/1 fixed windows that give the appearance of being double-hung, the remaining windows are single picture windows. All of the windows are aluminum framed, insulated glass, and black in color; overhead apparatus bay doors will be of two types, the front bays facing E. Canal St. will be aluminum framed, black in color with solid panels on the top and bottom, and the middle sections being glass; and the rear doors will be aluminum framed, black trim, and dark gray panels with the middle panel being glass. The report continued: lighting of the new site will be of three types --the main lights on the façade are a straight arm bracket, with a bell-shaped hood for downward lighting, and black in color, secondary accent or architectural lights will be mounted with a wall mounted bracket, a curved profile providing up and down accent lighting on the building and black in color, parking lot will have four pole lights, two along the east for the parking lot and two along the rear property line for the rear drive aisle, and these lights having the same bell-shaped light fixture as the building, and be black in color. The report also noted that: entry to the building will feature a new ground sign using matching materials of the building, incorporating the historic bell from the City of Troy Fire Station that used to be located at City Hall, which is in front of the current Fire Station No. 1, Along with a new flag pole with decorative ground lighting and landscaping for these features; all mechanical equipment will be mounted on the roof, not visible from any of the street due to the parapets on the building; the backup generator and trash bins will be in an enclosure that will completely screen the equipment and is designed to match the building; the site will also have all new driveway aprons, drive aisles, parking area, curbing, and new sidewalks; there will be a complete landscape plan to complement the new structure and provide screening and buffering of the site and off-street parking; and staff recommends approval based on the findings that:

- The proposed alterations are in keeping with the historic nature of the district.
- The proposed development is in keeping with the City Zoning Ordinance and the Secretary of the Interiors, new construction guidelines.
- The alteration does not alter any of the historical or architectural features of the property.

DISCUSSION. Mr. Kappers asked for an explanation of a front loading lot, with Mr. Watson commenting the building will be against the sidewalk in some areas. Mr. Kappers noted that the building that had been demolished on this site was located against the sidewalk in some areas.

Wolke asked about a sliding pole and was advised that pole currently in Station #1 will be moved to the new Station #1.

Mr. McGarry, asked about the comments regarding the Secretary of Interior Guidelines and asked if those are required. Staff advised that those Guidelines are referenced in City codes.

A motion was made by Mr. Wolke, seconded by Mr. Westmeyer, that the Troy Planning Commission approved all the design elements, colors, materials, and plantings for the new City Fire Station at 110 E. Canal Street as submitted, noted in the staff report and as included in the application, and based on the findings of staff that:

- The proposed alterations are in keeping with the historic nature of the district.
- The proposed development is in keeping with the City Zoning Ordinance and the Secretary of the Interiors, new construction guidelines.
- The alteration does not alter any of the historical or architectural features of the property.

MOTION PASSED, UNANIMOUS VOTE

APPLICATION TO HAVE THE DOWNTOWN/RIVERFRONT OVERLAY (DR-O) DISTRICT APPLIED TO THE BLOCK OF EAST CANAL STREET BETWEEN SOUTH WALNUT STREET AND SOUTH MULBERRY STREET, ALONG WITH HALF OF THE BLOCK BETWEEN EAST CANAL STREET AND EAST RACE STREET. THE UNDERLYING ZONING IS B-3, CENTRAL BUSINESS DISTRICT; OWNER/APPLICANT - CITY OF TROY The staff report read:

"The applicant, the City of Troy Ohio, is requesting the Planning Commission to review the proposal for the new building site design, and sign structure for the property at 110 E. Canal Street using the Downtown/ Riverfront Overlay District.

PROPOSAL:

This proposal is for the construction of a new 17,368 square feet, fire station building. This site and proposed building will be the replacement of the existing Fire Station One. This property encompasses the block of East Canal between South Walnut and South Mulberry. Along with half of the block between East Canal and East Race Street.

The proposed site design will feature the new fire station front loaded on the site and off-set to the northwest corner of East Canal and South Walnut Streets. With off-street parking, driveway access and landscaping being primarily located to the east and south portions of the lot.

This final site design was reviewed by city staff, and has been determined that this project does not meet a few of the design requirements of the underlying zoning districts of the B-3 zoning district, which are itemized below. All other aspects of the project do meet the requirements of the Zoning Code.

DISCUSSION:

Using the DR-O process outlined in the Zoning Code, below is a list of items that do not meet the standard requirements and will need to be approved by the Planning Commission (through the DR-O process) for this project at 110 E. Canal Street to continue forward.

Buffer Yard – The proposed plan has a buffer yard along the east property line along S. Mulberry Street. The ordinance requires a Twenty-five feet wide buffer when a Commercial zoning is adjacent to a Residential zoning. The request is to have a twelve and a half-foot reduction of this buffer yard. The reduction of this buffer yard allows for the site to have all of the parking for the building as off-street parking spaces, and vehicular movement on the site as needed for the fire department. The provided twelve and a half feet wide buffer strip will comply with the quantity of landscaping and the screening standards as required to the neighboring residential properties.

Landscape Buffer Yard – The proposed design has a landscaped buffer along the entire east property line along S. Mulberry Street. The ordinance requires a minimum of a fifteen feet buffer width of landscaping. The request is to allow the reduction of the landscape buffer width by two and a half feet, from the required fifteen feet to the designed twelve and a half feet. The landscaping plan will be installed to provide the required amount of screening and landscaping material as required by the ordinance for a commercial use next to the residential use across S. Mulberry Street.

Sign Setbacks – The proposed plan shows the primary ground sign for the new fire station to be located at the front entrance of the building. Located at the corner of E. Canal and S. Walnut Streets. The sign regulations require a ten feet setback from the right of way for all signs. Based on the design and layout of the site, this requirement is not able to be met. The requested reduction of the ten feet setback to five and a half feet from both rights-of-way of E. Canal and S. Walnut Streets. This will allow the site to have the proposed ground sign that matches the building design, and meets all of the other commercial zoning requirements for signage. Along with providing the new station proper identification at the public entrance of the building. The sign location will still allow for the required sidewalks for entry to the building, landscaping around the sign and site distances while at the intersection.

Separation of Off-Street Parking – Along the S. Walnut driveway, the parking stalls for the handicapped parking and one regular space does not meet the minimum ten feet required setback from the right of way. With the building being front loaded to both E. Canal and S. Walnut Streets. The 10 feet requirement is not able to be met and have the required number of off-street spaces on the site. If the spaces are shifted over, the interior landscaping requirements will not be met. The spaces cannot be eliminated or relocated as they provide the best location for ADA compliance. All other requirements required by the ordinance with curbing and landscaping have been met. The request is for the reduction of the separation requirement to the designed one and a half feet.

There are no other additional review items concerning the Utility and Engineering departments.

As stated in section 1143.25(q)(1)(c) of City of Troy Zoning Code, Planning Commission shall review all DR-O applications and shall grant, modify, or deny/and or recommend the denial, or modifications of such application based upon the following criteria:

1. To prevent hazards to the health and safety of the public and of all occupants of the improved real property.
2. To assure adequate light, air, and convenience of access for all properties.
3. To promote the delivery of public services such as utilities, streets, refuse collection, emergency medical services, fire and police protection.
4. To provide for creatively designed single-use and mixed-use Planned Developments, and to preserve their character and vitality through ongoing regulatory supervision.
5. To assure, through an appropriate site plan review that the general, district and supplementary regulations of this Zoning Code are being followed in the design of each new site improvement or redevelopment.

6. To minimize adverse effects on traffic safety caused by development and certain land uses.
7. To minimize adverse effects on the environment resulting from development and certain land uses.
8. To facilitate the efficient and economical development and use of land and public facilities.
9. To allocate to each site development, rather than to the public, the maximum feasible portion of the infrastructure and operating costs which arise as a result of that development.
10. To fairly balance the interest of property owners and occupants in continuing their nonconforming land uses against the community interest in achieving full compliance with this Zoning Code.
11. To protect floodways and flood plains from development which increases the general risk of flooding or puts occupants of the development at risk.
12. To preserve and enhance property values.
13. To protect public and private water supplies, both in quality and quantity.
14. To promote the economic vitality of business and industry.
15. To direct particular land uses to the parcels of land best suited for them physically and in terms of access to highways and public services.
16. To enhance the predictability and profitability of private investments made in the City.
17. To continuously improve the aesthetic character of all parts of the City.

With the creation of the Downtown/Riverfront Overlay District, the intent is for the district to be applied when the conventional zoning requirements are inappropriate or the underlying zoning district is unduly restrictive by providing an optional alternative to the regulations of properties in downtown Troy. This proposed site design for the new fire station is utilizing a previously underutilized site. The new design is compliant with the majority of the ordinance requirements. This design creates a new site for the needed facilities for the City of Troy Fire Department and its service to the city. Along with providing a well thought out site that considers the overall design, surrounding buildings, neighborhood, and needs of the department.

The site is constricted due to the size of the lots, existing right-of-way's and utilities, while providing all parking needs with off-street parking, and appropriate access in and out of the site.

The proposed plan while it does address the majority of the ordinance requirements. This plan does require some reductions of the conventional requirements of the Troy Zoning Code and Sign code.

Utilizing the criteria intended to justify a DR-O application; you will find the proposed project will have a minimal effect on the environment and neighborhood, as most of the standard zoning and sign code requirements have been met by the proposed development. This proposed development has taken into account the existing commercial uses and the surrounding residential properties into the design of this proposal.

NEXT STEPS:

This is the first step in the DR-O process which is the first reading of the proposal to the Planning Commission. A second reading (required hearing) will be held at the next scheduled Planning Commission meeting. The second reading will provide an opportunity for public input on the project. Planning Commission can only take action after the second hearing as required by the DR-O process and a decision will be requested by the Planning Commission at the second meeting."

Discussion:

Mr. Kappers asked about the buffer, noting that is usually between properties, and commented that this is a buffer to the street. Staff commented that such buffer is appropriate based on the zoning.

Regarding the fire bell that will be moved from current Station 1, it was stated that this is not used, is more symbolic, and would not disturb neighbors.

NEXT MEETING: The Commission will not meet Nov. 25, the Day before Thanksgiving.

FUTURE MEETINGS – REMOTE OR IN PERSON: At the prior meeting, the Commission considered meeting in person at the Bravo Room, Hobart Arena, unless COVID-19 restrictions prohibit, and as long as the Bravo Room is available. Mr. Titterington commented that with the rising COVID-19 cases, Council is being asked to consider extending remote meetings as long as the Governor's State of Emergency is in place. The Commission determined to continue meeting remotely via Zoom as long as legally permitted to do so, until further notice.

There being no further business, the meeting adjourned at 3:57 p.m. upon motion of Mr. Wolke, seconded by Mr. Westmeyer.

Respectfully submitted,

_____ Chairman

_____ Secretary